Spring 2002

An Investigation of How Integrating Visual Art Into the Language Arts Curriculum Affects Children's Reading Achievement in a First Grade Classroom

Lisa Zona
The College at Brockport, lzona@spencerportschools.org

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.brockport.edu/ehd_theses
Part of the Elementary Education and Teaching Commons

To learn more about our programs visit: http://www.brockport.edu/ehd/

Repository Citation
http://digitalcommons.brockport.edu/ehd_theses/508

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Education and Human Development at Digital Commons @Brockport. It has been accepted for inclusion in Education and Human Development Master’s Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @Brockport. For more information, please contact kmyers@brockport.edu.
SUNY COLLEGE AT BROCKPORT

AN INVESTIGATION OF HOW INTEGRATING
VISUAL ART INTO THE LANGUAGE ARTS
CURRICULUM AFFECTS CHILDREN’S READING
ACHIEVEMENT IN A FIRST GRADE CLASSROOM

By
Lisa Zona

A Thesis submitted to the Department of Education and
Human Development in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of Master of Science in
Education.

Degree Awarded:
Spring Semester, 2002
SUBMITTED BY:

Jove M. Zane  
Candidate  

Date

APPROVED BY:

Arthur E. Smith  
Thesis Advisor  

Date

Second Faculty Reader  

Date

Director of Graduate Studies  

Date
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my family for allowing me the opportunity to pursue my second career.

A special thank you goes to the first grade teachers, Mrs. Tracy Zimmerman and Mrs. Shannon Heller at Terry A. Taylor Elementary School, for their participation in this study.

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Arthur Smith and Dr. Gerald Begy for their support and guidance.
Abstract

The purpose of the study was to investigate how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affected children's reading achievement. The study included 2 classes of first graders. The control group followed the first grade art curriculum, which consists of learning to use different media, learning about the elements of art, and creating art. The experimental group participated in arts activities that reinforced the content of children's literature stories used as part of the language arts program.

The experimental research study was analyzed using quantitative methods. A comparison of the running reading records of both groups for the two month time frame was done to determine if there were any changes in the reading achievement of the experimental group. A t-test was used to determine if any changes in achievement was due to the one variable of the integrated arts.
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Statement of the Problem</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need for the Study</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Limitations of the Study</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Review of the Literature</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arts and Literacy</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing and Drawing and Literacy</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Arts and Academics</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Design of the Study</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hypothesis</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analysis of Data</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Findings and Interpretations</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyzing the Findings and Interpreting the Data</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Conclusions and Implications</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose of the Study</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for Classroom Use</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implications for Research</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Table of Contents (Continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>References</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appendices</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Art Lesson Plans Integrating Language Arts</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Samples From the Study of the Children's Art Work</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

Statement of the Problem

Purpose

The purpose of this study was to investigate how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affects children’s reading achievement in a first grade classroom.

Need for the Study

In the current economy, cuts are being made to many programs in New York State schools. The first item to go on the chopping block is funding for the arts. The problem of fiscal shortages is not unique to New York State. In Alejandro’s study of integrating visual arts, writing, and reading, the Texas Education Agency “threatened to close its public schools unless compromises could be reached about how to distribute education funding fairly” (1994, p. 13). Many states have adopted a standardized test-driven curriculum in order to keep funding for basic programs.

Art is not considered a basic program and it is not mandated in New York State. Alejandro describes the Education Agency’s objective to raise scores in reading, writing, and math to the extent that “art and beauty are frivolities in which we just cannot indulge our students” (1994, p. 13). Arts advocates,
educators and many parents believe that the arts are not frivolities and they are an important component in a child’s education.

Research has shown that the processes children use in creating, critiquing, and experiencing art helps them to succeed in all academic subjects. Many research studies have proven that arts integration benefits children of all ability levels. According to the findings of DuPont’s study of fifth-grade remedial students “comprehension skills, as measured by standardized and criterion-referenced tests, are enhanced through a reading program that utilizes the strategy of creative drama” (1992, p. 49). Usova’s study of integrating art and language arts for first grade at-risk children revealed that “Standardized test results showed marked improvement in reading and language ability, and statistically significant gains in writing ability as compared to a control group” (1993, p.117).

There are school districts that provide students with the choice to attend arts-rich schools that integrate the arts with the core curriculum. In Norwalk, California, Cesar Chavez Elementary School uses the teaching-through-the-arts approach. Elliot (1998) states:

Students study dance, music, visual arts and drama - not as so many addons (the first thing to go when the budget is cut), but as important disciplines that can be used to help kids master math, science, social studies and language arts. (p. 36)
Burton, Horowitz and Abeles (2000) completed a two-year study of arts-rich public schools. The results of the research were:

To offer empirical evidence that learning in arts-rich schools is complex and that it is most successful when supported by a rich, continuous, and sequenced curriculum. Within these schools it was clear that teachers thought about, and accepted, a variety of different ways for pupils to be creative, to exercise skills and to think through problems, and exercise imagination in the construction of paintings, musical compositions, choreography, and plays. The findings led us to the conclusion that, all things being equal, the arts are neither ancillary nor core but rather that they are participants in the development of critical ways of thinking and learning (p.44).

While many art educators would argue that children should be allowed to create art for art’s sake, Eisner takes this one step further when justifying the merits of art education by describing how arts educators who do not view their program as “really important in their own right. Their importance is located in their contribution to more important subjects” (1998, p. 12). In discussing the merits of an art education, Mitchell (1990) states:

Rethinking the means by which these two disciplines, art and children’s literature, are integrated is becoming more critical in light of the profound philosophical and curricular changes being proposed for art education at both the primary and secondary levels. (p. 839)

Art research is vital to keep the art programs in schools. Without funding, certified teachers, and support from administration the arts will continue to lose in the budget crunch and children will have a valuable part of their education taken away from them.
**Question**

The question investigated in this study was:

Will the integration of art activities into the language arts curriculum affect children’s reading achievement?

**Limitation of the Study**

The study had two limitations. First, the study only included 38 students in two first grade classrooms. Second, the study only covered a 2-month time frame.

**Summary**

Research indicates that the integration of the arts into the language arts curriculum benefits student learning due to the processes students use to create art. These skills transfer to reading, writing, and other subject areas.

This study evaluated the use of integrated arts activities developed by the researcher that combined with language arts children’s literature stories. The data were analyzed to see if there was a significant difference in the reading achievement of the two first grade classes.
CHAPTER II
Review of the literature

The purpose of this study was to investigate how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum will affect reading achievement in a first grade classroom. The following research relating to this study included art and literacy, writing and drawing and literacy, and the arts and academics.

THE ARTS AND LITERACY

Children’s artwork can reveal many different aspects of their personalities and capabilities while also providing a window into how they view the world and make meaning from it. This same artwork gives us the ability to determine if a student is ready to read. If students can create drawings of related objects then they are developmentally capable of relating letters to each other and ready to start the process of learning to read (Hale, 1998).

The study of art and literacy by Perkins (1989) indicated that cognitive development was reinforced by children’s artwork. “The children’s pictures involve their feelings and imagination. Art expression of their experiences gives substance to their learning and make it possible” (Perkins, 1989, p. 96). Children use pictures to express themselves at a very early age when language development is emerging. The ability to express emotions through art without using language
provides children with a different way in which to communicate what they have learned.

Art is one of the many ways in which children construct and convey meaning. Bartelo (1990) explored children's language processes of listening, speaking, reading, drawing, and writing in response to story. The four conclusions drawn from the study were:

1. Children use many language processes to construct meaning.
2. Children differ in which language processes they tend to use.
3. These patterns of movement within and across the modes and the language process illustrate strategies children are using in the construction of meaning.
4. The categories developed in this study are a beginning step in classifying the dimensions of meaning displayed in children's retellings and picture stories (p.165).

While children use these many different modes of language to communicate what they have learned, the comparison study of print-based literacy and art literacy by Albers (1997) gives insight into the role of the visual arts as another means of communication. "Like print-based literacy, meaning making in art is multiple, dynamic, and situated within personal experience. Literacy in art takes time and is a process, similar to that in print-based literacy, in which students generate, revise, edit, and reflect upon their meaning making" (1997, p. 339).

Albers two-year qualitative study of 250 6th grade middle school art students involved "listening and engaging in students’ talk as they constructed
meaning, examined their artworks and art journals” (p. 340). The observation of the art students and their teacher, Louise Wolf, gave insight into “role of the teacher, students’ enculturation in art, art as a process, and reflection in art” (p. 340). Albers defines literacy in art as “a process in which students outgrow themselves, solve meaning-making problems, and enable themselves to take risks with expression and technique.” (p. 344)

In discussing art as a communication system Albers states:

Art has an even greater power to inform the meaning-making of others than written language does. That is, art commands an immediate reading that written language does not. We are stopped by and immediately respond to Georgia O'Keefe’s “Black Iris III” in a way we cannot do with Virginia Wolf’s A Room of One’s Own. With art we read and respond to a painting in much less time than we can read and respond to a novel, short story, or even a poem. (p. 345)

Children use art to communicate and Perkins (1989) studied how “children communicate by art expression alone, art expression and print, art expression and oral language.” (p. 97) She states:

The results of the study suggest that young children’s artwork is a very important element in the development of their literacy. Although it is a “part” of the whole process of learning, it is without a doubt, an underestimated mode of learning. (p. 97)

The language used by children gives them the opportunity to express themselves when they do not have the ability developmentally in oral or written language. The research study by Hale and Boozer (1998) explored the assessment of reading abilities using young children’s artwork. Through the observation of 12
first-grade students, individual case studies were analyzed to determine if art
development stages and emergent reading levels corresponded. The students’
artwork was collected monthly and emergent reading levels were determined by
the teacher using a scale that was developed by the researchers. As the students
improved their artistic skills and moved to the next level of art development their
emergent literacy levels also increased. The researchers concluded that when
artwork is examined and compared to the students reading levels, that artwork can
be used as a tool in the assessment of reading level or ability. The students studied
were in two different levels of art development. Stage 2 is the preschematic stage
where students draw objects that appear random in space. Stage 3 is the schematic
stage where students connect items in their drawings. Chapman (1978) describes
how children’s early elementary artwork is a “part-by-part thought process;
however they now show greater detail within parts”(p. 166).

While the visual arts are an important component of a student’s education,
there are other “arts” that are equally important. Drama, music, and dance can be
used to teach children literacy skills. In her 1992 research study of creative
drama’s effect on the comprehension skills of fifth graders, DuPont formed three
groups of 17 students as sample groups and worked with them for six weeks. The
treatment group read children’s literature stories and participated in drama
activities, the second group read those same stories and discussed them, and the
third group used their current program of study. She investigated the use of
creative drama as a strategy to help students learn how to read and determined that when children have been “involved in the process of integrating creative drama with reading they are not only able to comprehend better what they have read and acted out, but they are also better able to comprehend what they read but do not act out, such as written scenarios they encounter on standardized tests” (p.50). The subjects of her study scored higher on standardized test because they gained the skill of using mental images of text when they were called upon to act out what they had read.

The use of mental imagery as a strategy for enhancing reading comprehension was studied by Gambrell and Jawitz (1993). As part of the research study they taught students how to first use the mental imagery strategy and combined that with teaching students how to attend to illustrations. The researchers concluded that the students’ comprehension increased because they had to tap into their prior knowledge and individual experiences to create meaning.

Drama activities used in the classroom can enhance learning by allowing children another way in which to construct and convey meaning. Many research studies have shown that drama activities help students with comprehension, reading and writing. Moore and Caldwell’s (1993) research focused on the effects of drama and drawing on narrative writing of children in the primary grades. They found that “as they involve creative products in themselves, drama and drawing
allow the writer to test out, evaluate, revise, and integrate ideas before writing begins. Thus, drama and drawing are more complete forms of rehearsal for writing than discussion” (p.109).

Different types of media affect a student’s ability to process information (Moore & Caldwell, 1993). Some students can grasp concepts better if the information is presented to them in a different way, perhaps by using art, music, drama or dance. This gives students the advantage of using a different mode of learning to understand and express their own ideas. When students are just learning about the writing process, “these can be nonverbal modes of representation that enhance creativity by increasing the speed, flexibility, and depth of processing before the individual uses written language to stabilize and organize ideas” (p. 109).

When children begin to read literature and want to bring the characters they are reading about to life, they can do this through drama activities. According to Rosenberg’s study (as cited in DuPont, 1987), “children must make inferences about the reasons for actions of certain characters, understand basic natures of the different characters and their emotions, identify what led to the main events in the story, and use critical reading skills to sense the mood of the selections in order to dramatize a story” (p. 42).
WRITING AND DRAWING AND LITERACY

There is a strong relationship between the written word and illustrations in books. Illustrations enable readers to obtain information that may or may not be written in the text. Illustrations help readers to use syntactic clues in reading the accompanying text. Much research has been done on how student-generated illustrations are used to provide students with a venue in which to express themselves and get their ideas across.

The integration of art throughout the entire process of writing and creating books provides a sense of richness, and children’s creative processes are evident in the finished products (Olshansky, 1994). When students used her Image-Making Within the Writing Process they incorporated the elements of art: color, texture, shape, form, and space and then added details to enhance the meaning of their writing. When students created books from homemade paper made into a collage, the visual images they created carried their stories beyond the text.

Johnson’s 1996 study of writing with illustration also involved students creating self-made books, but he studied the process of students planning and writing their own books. The results of his research were:

1. When writing is conceived within a graphic, page-oriented context, the planning of narrative episodes becomes easier for children. Visual boundaries lay a foundation on which can be built logical stages of writing development.
2. Interrelating words with pictures provides the young writer with a concrete visual reference—one is, in effect writing about the content of the picture.
3. The book form uniquely stimulates even the most reluctant students to communicate with others and to find their own voice. To make a book can be a great motivation for students and enhances developing literacy skills. (p. 504)

Children speak simultaneously with their drawings and writings (Bartelo, 1999). Stories are an ideal way for students to explore writing as they bring their experiences and imaginations to life. Students are successful when their narrative writing creates and manipulates an imaginary world. Children also benefit when a planning activity for writing involves drawing and drama instead of the traditional discussion method used in language arts classes (Moore & Caldwell, 1993).

A single piece of art can be considered the artist's text. Frei (1999) investigated the ways in which children’s prior knowledge is reflected in conversations about art, the way children make meaning from art by their attention to details, and the ways the meaning-making process is evident from children’s conversations about art. Frei selected six children for his study to examine art slides to reveal the process and strategies they used to construct meaning of visual symbols. The key elements that the students utilized were:

- The use of prior knowledge;
- Attention to textual details;
- Integration of knowledge and text; and
- Different stances toward the text, which resulted in meanings that were directly rooted to the text or to children’s lives. (p. 387)
The students developed logical explanations and created stories to explain their understanding of artwork using typical behaviors of language learning. Frei stated:

The nearly universal experience of looking at images may provide one way to uncover emergent readers’ literacy strategies and processes prior to their ability to engage in a sophisticated way with written text. Art, then, needs to be considered as a primary vehicle to understanding children’s literacy processes and strategies, as well as a means to enrich and expand children’s literacy potential. (p. 392)

Green stated (as cited in Frei, 1999) that “art images allow for children to expand their ways of viewing the world as individuals, use their imagination, go beyond what it is presented on a two-dimensional surface” (p. 392).

In his study of writing with illustration Johnson (1996) states:

Just as the text embodies tension and release, so the illustrations satisfy different nuances of the reader’s imagination. At a deeper level, all these elements are played off one against the other, forming a complexity of linguistically and visually conveyed images which the mind attempts to construct into a multi-sensorially thrilling experience (p. 504).

Literature logs have been used to encourage children to respond to books. Short, Kauffman, and Kahn (2000) discussed in their study of responding to literature across multiple sign systems that when the teachers “invited the children to use webs, charts, sketches, and diagrams their logs immediately took on a different quality as they combined words and images to think in more complex ways” (p. 162). Responding to literature can also be done using art activities. Wells found inspiration for teaching art concepts in children’s literature and
described how “a good book can be the springboard needed to inspire and motivate students to create some fantastic artworks” (2000 p. 34).

THE ARTS AND ACADEMICS

Reading and writing are not the only areas where learning has been enhanced by integrating the arts. Students in all academic areas benefit from an arts integrated curriculum. According to Burton, Horowitz and Abeles (1999) the arts add a kind of richness and depth to learning and only schools where arts are provided as an essential part of instruction consider the arts critical for healthy development.

Forseth (1976) investigated art activities used as part of instruction in mathematics. She suggested that art may improve children’s attitude toward learning and in turn that may affect achievement. Even though math uses a logical thinking mode and art is part of the visual mode of thinking they interact favorably (Forseth, 1976). This mix of thinking modes is typical of most creative artists, scientists, and thinkers in general (Burton, Horowitz & Abeles, 1999).

The same concepts that have helped readers and writers succeed can also transfer over to other academic learning. Those concepts of making inferences, and using prior knowledge to make sense of the world benefit science, math and social studies students (Frei, 1999). Góldonowicz (1985) described the connections that art has to the subjects of English, science, mathematics, physical
education, social studies, music, and religion. Burton, Horowitz and Abeles (1999) speculated “that the kind of persistence that it takes to be successful in the arts, particularly in the processes and organization required to represent thoughts and ideas, would have general cross-curriculum relevance” (p.40).

These same researchers discovered that high arts participation gave students specific abilities that helped them succeed in all academic areas. These were the ability to:

- Express ideas and feelings openly and thoughtfully;
- Form relationships among different items of experience and layer them in thinking through an idea or problem;
- Conceive or imagine different vantage points of an idea or problem and to work towards a resolution;
- Construct and organize thoughts and ideas into meaningful units or wholes; and
- Focus perception on an item or items of experience, and sustain this focus over a period of time (p. 42).

Academic success can be achieved when students’ learning styles are taken into consideration as lessons are developed by the teacher. Sidelnick discussed how instructional strategies that focus on children’s strengths will encourage children to participate and to become engaged in the learning process (2000). When lessons are planned that incorporate visual, kinesthetic, and auditory learning modalities all children benefit. Visual learners are motivated when allowed to express their ideas through drawings. Kline’s (1984) study of the use of self-generated drawings as a strategy for teaching sight vocabulary allowed children the opportunity to draw pictures of vocabulary words. She discussed how
the "self-generated drawing method can conceivably provide children the means of successful experiences to early learning. A drawing method may assist a teacher in motivating children's interest in language" (p. 34).

Summary

The literature reviewed in this chapter indicates the many effects that integrating the arts has on learning. The use of art, music, and drama in the classroom motivates children and adds interest to daily activities. When educators incorporate different modalities to teach concepts children learn in the style that best suits their needs. The literature also indicates how the different processes that children use to create art and the transfer of that learning to other subject areas, especially reading and writing are important implications in the classroom.
CHAPTER III

Design of the Study

Purpose

The purpose of this study was to investigate how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affects children’s reading achievement in a first grade classroom.

Null Hypothesis

There is no statistically significant difference between the mean reading achievement scores of the control group and the experimental group.

Methodology

Subjects

The study included 38 students from a suburban, upstate New York school district. The subjects consisted of two classes of a heterogeneous group of first graders. The control group followed the first grade art curriculum which consists of learning to use different media, learning about the elements of art, and creating art. The experimental group participated in arts activities that reinforced the content of children’s literature stories used as part of the language arts program.
Materials

The materials used in the study were children’s literature story books used for shared reading. The following books were chosen to integrate visual art activities using art materials and lesson plans:

Bet You Can’t by Penny Dale (Macmillan/McGraw-Hill)

Down By the Bay, illustrations by Consuelo Udave (Macmillan/McGraw-Hill)

Jasper’s Beanstalk by Nick Batterworth and Mick Inkpen (Macmillan/McGraw-Hill)

An egg is an egg by Nicke Weiss (Macmillan/McGraw-Hill)

White Rabbits Color Book by Alan Baker (Macmillan/McGraw-Hill)

Students running reading records were examined to evaluate student’s progress.

Procedures

Within the framework of the first grade art curriculum, the researcher provided the students in the experimental group with art activities that reinforced the content of the literature stories and investigated the illustrations of the story books (see Appendix A for complete lesson plans and Appendix B for examples of student work). The researcher met with each group for two 45-minute blocks of time in a six day rotating schedule. The study was conducted over a two month period and five books were selected for integrated art activities. Each literature story included one art activity that was completed in two class session. The control group continued with the first grade art curriculum.
Analysis of Data

The experimental research study was analyzed using quantitative methods. A comparison of the running reading records of both groups for the two month time frame was made to determine if there were any changes in the reading achievement of the experimental group. A \( t \) test was used to determine if any changes in achievement were due to the one variable of the integrated arts lessons.

Summary

This study was designed to investigate the effects of integrating the visual arts with language arts on reading achievement in a first grade classroom. The students' running reading records were compared to see if the integrated art activities affected reading achievement for the experimental group. A \( t \) test was used to determine if there were statistically significant differences between the two groups.
CHAPTER IV

Findings and Interpretations

Purpose

The purpose of this research was to determine how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affects children's reading achievement in a first grade classroom.

Analyzing the Findings and Interpreting the Data

The following null hypothesis was investigated in this study:

There is no statistically significant difference between the mean reading achievement scores of the control group and the experimental group.

Table 1

$t$ Test Comparison of the Running Reading Records of the Control Group and the Experimental Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Control Group</th>
<th>Experimental Group</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>13.05263</td>
<td>9.315789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variance</td>
<td>79.7193</td>
<td>11.22807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>df</td>
<td>36</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$t$ Stat</td>
<td>1.707995</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| $P(T\leq t)$ two-tail | 0.096248 | }

$t$ Critical two-tail

2.028091
A two-sample assuming equal variances two-tailed distribution $t$ test was calculated to determine if there was a statistical difference between the two groups' running reading record instructional levels. The probability $P(T<=t)$ that the variable affected the results is 0.096248 (Table 1). The critical $t$ at the .05 level is 2.028091. Therefore, the data failed to reject the null hypothesis. There was no statistically significant difference between the control groups' and experimental groups' running reading record scores.

**Summary**

This study was designed to investigate the effects of integrating the visual arts with language arts on reading achievement in a first grade classroom. The instructional level of the running reading records of both groups was compared using the $t$ test. There was no statistically significant difference between the reading achievement of the control group and the experimental group.
CHAPTER V

Conclusions and Implications

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this research was to determine how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affects children’s reading achievement in a first grade classroom.

Conclusions

The results of the data analysis indicate no statistically significant differences between the reading achievement of the control group and the experimental group. While the results indicated no statistically significant differences, there is clearly a trend towards significance in favor of the treatment to the experimental group when comparing the control group’s mean score of 9.315789 and the experimental group’s mean score of 13.05263. This trend could become even more evident with a larger sample of a minimum of 60 students for a longer period of time.

One reason no statistical difference was evident between the two groups could be due to the speculation that some of the skills used in the arts, such as making decisions, making observations, and making meaning helped the students in the control group transfer those same skills to language learning.
Implications for the Classroom

Providing students with arts activities that enhance learning can be implemented in any classroom. Teachers are the most important element in providing an arts-rich curriculum for their students. Teacher training should include the skills needed to develop strategies that enable students to gain insight into themselves as learners through the arts.

Time should also be an important consideration for allowing students the opportunity to view artwork, discuss their own art and the artwork of others, and participate in creating art. Arts activities that are included as part of the curriculum, especially in reading and writing should use different modalities to help students learn in a variety of ways. Research has indicated that when lessons are planned that incorporate visual, kinesthetic, and auditory learning modalities all children benefit (Burton, Horowitz, & Abeles, 1999; Moore & Caldwell, 1993; Sidelnick & Svoboda, 2000).

A variety of art materials should be readily available in an area of the room that includes a sink, tables, and storage. This will enable students to have a place where they can make a mess and it won’t affect the rest of the class. This should be a place where students can make books by illustrating their own written stories or just create art and express themselves. Another area of the room should include a puppet theatre, puppets, costumes, and musical instruments. These
should be made available for students to act out the stories they have created, play dress-up, or play in a band.

The purpose of reading instruction is to provide students with opportunities to develop literacy, and using the arts is just another tool to help students succeed in reading and writing. The learning that takes place in the arts is knowledge that can be transferred to other academic subjects. Providing students with an arts-rich curriculum benefits all learners.

**Implications for Research**

Expansion of this research could include a study on how daily art activities affect students’ comprehension. Further research of this study could include a post-test for both groups. Due to the fact that student’s running reading records were utilized to compare data, a post-test for both groups of comprehension questions related only to the stories used for art activities could have provided the researcher insight into the effects of the art activities on the experimental group’s achievement.

Forseth’s (1976) suggestion that further research may reveal that the use of art activities designed to reinforce other subjects may be an essential element in elementary curriculum for maintaining favorable attitudes toward learning in many subjects could be expanded to include a comparative study of an arts
integrated classroom and a regular classroom setting in the same school/grade level to provide insight into how the arts enhance learning and the benefits of integrating the arts into curriculum.

Further case studies are needed to expand the data on children's language process use and the dimensions of meaning displayed in their responses to stories (Bartelo, 1990). This could be studied in combination with response to illustrations and art. Another study could expand Hale and Boozer's (1998) investigation into how children's artwork should be used as a literacy assessment tool and define the criteria used to make this type of assessment viable.

An expansion of the research conducted by Gambrell and Jawitz (1993) could examine the benefits of mental imagery on visual learners' comprehension. Further studies on the effects of using different modalities to teach reading could provide insight into the benefits of using visual, kinesthetic, and auditory activities to enhance learning.

**Summary**

The basic goal of this study was to determine how integrating visual art into the language arts curriculum affects children's reading achievement in a first grade classroom. The analysis of the data indicated that there were no statistically significant differences between the reading achievement of the control group and the experimental group. Although, when reviewing the data the trend towards
significance is evident, and a longer study that involved a larger sample could show a more significant statistical difference in favor of the integrated arts activities.

Previous research examined the many effects that integrating the arts has on learning and how the different processes that children use to create art and the transfer of that learning to other subject areas, especially reading and writing are important implications in the classroom. The literature reviewed reinforced the benefits of using the arts to enhance learning in all subject areas, especially reading and writing. The processes that students use to create art were determined to be essential elements to the entire learning experience.

The use of integrated arts activities can help all students to learn new information in many different ways. The benefits of an art-rich curriculum supports learners by providing students with educational experiences that tap into the different modalities of learning. The more opportunities given to students to learn new information, the greater the chance for success.


Appendix A

Art Lesson Plans Integrating Language Arts
ART LESSON PLAN  Grade 1  TITLE  Jasper and His Beanstalk Drawings

STANDARDS  Standard 1: Creating, performing, participating in the arts.  Standard 2: Knowing and using arts materials and resources.  Standard 3: Responding to and analyzing works of art.  Standard 4: Understanding the cultural dimensions and contributions of art.

Elements of Art  Line  Shape  Form  Space  Color  Texture

Objectives: The students will use tracers to trace 3 Jasper the cats in sequence according to the story. The students will color each Jasper and add a background to the picture. The students will make a beanstalk from construction paper and glue it to their picture.

Set: Who can tell me the beginning, middle, and end of the story “Jasper’s Beanstalk”?

Vocabulary  Sequence  Tracer

Materials  12 x 18 white paper  crayons and pencils  scissors  glue  green construction paper  18 tracers - 6 of Jasper with bean, 6 of Jasper waiting, and 6 of Jasper facing up

Resources/Notes  “Jasper’s Beanstalk” by Nick Batterworth and Mick Inkpen  A completed drawing

Procedure:
1.) Set
2.) Discuss how the tracers are used and how to trace the cats in order/sequence. Demonstrate how to add bean to Jasper’s hand in the drawing.
3.) Distribute the tracers and paper.
4.) The students will trace the cats in sequence, thinking about the beginning, middle, and end of the story. They will then add the details with crayons.
5.) The students will cut out a beanstalk with leaves of their own design and glue it to the drawing.
6.) Students will clean up and put away supplies.

Evaluation/Assessment:
Closure
The students will give a thumbs up if they placed their cats in sequence.
ART LESSON PLAN  Grade 1  TITLE  Down by the Bay Mural

STANDARDS  Standard 1: Creating, performing, participating in the arts.  Standard 2: Knowing and using arts materials and resources.  Standard 3: Responding to and analyzing works of art.  Standard 4: Understanding the cultural dimensions and contributions of art

Elements of Art  Line  Shape  Form  Space  Color  Texture

Objectives: The students will draw the characters of the story "Down by the Bay" in pairs. They will cut out, color and glue to large blue paper to create a mural. The students will cut out palm tree leaves and trunks and watermelons to add to the mural.

Set: Can you think of some of the characters from the story "Down by the Bay"?

Vocabulary
- Mural
- Overlap
- Texture

Materials
- 9 x 12 white paper
- crayons
- scissors
- reading books
- green and brown construction paper
- large blue background paper for mural
- 36 x 48

Resources/Notes
- "Down by the Bay"
- illustrated by Consuelo Udave

Procedure:
1.) Set
2.) Discuss the characters of the story. The students may use their books to help them draw the characters.
3.) The students will work with a partner to draw the characters. Students will color and cut out.
4.) When students finish I will demonstrate how to make palm trees and add texture with scissors on the leaves.
5.) The students will glue the trees to the mural and overlap the leaves. They will then glue the characters to the mural.
6.) Clean up and put away supplies.

Evaluation/Assessment:
Closure

We will place our mural on the bulletin board and point out the characters of the story. The students will tell what the characters of the story are doing (ex. Llamas eating pajamas) on the mural.
ART LESSON PLAN  Grade 1  TITLE White Rabbit's Color Patterns

STANDARDS
Standard 1: Creating, performing, participating in the arts. Standard 2: Knowing and using arts materials and resources.
Standard 3: Responding to and analyzing works of art. Standard 4: Understanding the cultural dimensions and contributions of art.

Elements of Art  Line  Shape  Form  Space  Color  Texture

Objectives: The students will create a plaid pattern using the primary colors to create secondary colors with watercolors. The students will color 6 bunnies using the primary colors and the secondary colors and cut them out. They will glue to the background plaid pattern.

Set: Who remembers the "Primary Color Song" we learned earlier this year? Sing song.

Vocabulary
Primary colors
Secondary colors
Plaid  Horizontal line
Pattern  Vertical line
Overlap

Materials
12 x 18 white paper  colored pencils
watercolor sets  scissors  glue
brushes  water cups
pencils  paper towels
copies of bunny-6 for each student

Resources/Notes
Prior demonstration of color mixing with shaving cream.
"White Rabbit's Color Book" by Alan Baker

Procedure:
1.) Set
2.) Discuss the color mixing fun we had in our last class with shaving cream.
3.) Demonstrate how to paint stripes in primary colors horizontally and how to overlap to create a plaid pattern using vertical stripes. The secondary colors will appear where 2 primary colors overlap. Show the example of painting a red horizontal stripe and then a blue vertical stripe, where the lines intersect will be the secondary color. Remind students not to paint the stripes too close together or the colors will run.
4.) Distribute the supplies/materials.
5.) Students will paint primary color stripes with watercolor to create secondary colors in a plaid pattern.
6.) Clean up and put away supplies.

Evaluation/Assessment:
Closure
Discuss how we will color 6 bunnies in the next art class to place on our plaid background. Sing "Primary Color Song" to close class.
ART LESSON PLAN  Grade 1  TITLE  Folded paper 3-D Transformers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARDS</th>
<th>Standard 1: Creating, performing, participating in the arts. Standard 2: Knowing and using arts materials and resources. Standard 3: Responding to and analyzing works of art. Standard 4: Understanding the cultural dimensions and contributions of art</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Elements of Art</th>
<th>Line____</th>
<th>Shape_x</th>
<th>Form_x</th>
<th>Space_x</th>
<th>Color____</th>
<th>Texture____</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Objectives: The students will create a transformer using the oak tag forms. The forms will fold to create a 3-D box. The students will draw a non-living thing on the outside of the transformer and a living thing (animal, person, plant) on the inside of the transformer using colored pencils.

Set: When you read "An egg is an egg" what were some of the things that changed or transformed into something else?

Vocabulary
Transform/Transformer
Living/Non-living thing
3-dimensional

Materials
Oak tag forms
Pencils
Colored pencils

Resources/Notes
Transformer toys
"An egg is an egg" by Nicke Weiss
Completed project

Procedure:
1.) Set
2.) Show students a toy transformer and discuss how things can change form. Show students example of final project. Discuss what living and non-living things they might draw on their transformers.
3.) Distribute the oak tag forms and show students which sides to draw the living object on and then show them where to draw the non-living object. The students will draw with colored pencils on the back (outside) and the front (inside).
4.) When complete the students will fold up the transformer to create a 3-D box, demonstrate and have students follow along by steps.
5.) Students will share artwork.
6.) Clean up.

Evaluation/Assessment:
Closure

Students will share their transformers with members at their tables and describe how they created their transformers.
## ART LESSON PLAN

**Grade 1**

**TITLE** Cooperation Crayon Resist

### STANDARDS
- Standard 1: Creating, performing, participating in the arts.
- Standard 2: Knowing and using arts materials and resources.
- Standard 3: Responding to and analyzing works of art.
- Standard 4: Understanding the cultural dimensions and contributions of art.

### Elements of Art
- Line
- Shape
- Form
- Space
- Color
- Texture

### Objectives:
After reading the story, “Bet You Can’t” the students will use crayons to create a picture of cooperation cleaning up. The picture will include student and sibling or relative. After the students color the picture they will use watercolor over the crayon to create a resist.

### Set:
Raise your hand if you have a brother or a sister.

### Vocabulary
- Sibling
- Cooperation
- Crayon resist

### Materials
- 12 x 18 white paper
- Watercolor sets
- Water cups
- Paper towels
- Crayons
- Brushes

### Resources/Notes
- “Bet You Can’t” by Penny Dale
- Example of completed project

### Procedure:
1. Set
2. Discussion of how we clean up our toys when we play in a group. Show example of crayon resist completed project.
3. Students will create a picture (using crayons) of an example of clean-up time at home with a sibling or family member.
4. The student will color the figures and some of the background. Remind students to leave some of the areas white for the watercolor.
5. Students will pick up paint supplies from the cart.
6. Students will paint with watercolor to create a resist.
7. Clean up by tables.

### Evaluation/Assessment:

#### Closure
Students will turn to one neighbor and they will share their pictures with one another. They will also describe how they created the picture.
Appendix B

Samples from the Study of Children’s Art Work
Jasper and his Beanstalk
Down by the Bay Mural
White Rabbit’s Color Patterns
3-D Box

Outside - non-living object

Inside - living thing
Outside - non-living object

Inside - living thing

Outside - non-living object

3-D Box
Inside - living thing
Crayon Resist Cooperation Paintings