7-28-1961

A Comparison of the Philosophy and of Teaching of Third Grade Reading According to Houghton Mifflin Company (McKee) the John C. Winston Company (Stauffer) and Ginn & Company (Russell) Basal Readers

Joy Morris Thomas
The College at Brockport

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.brockport.edu/ehd_theses
Part of the Elementary Education Commons, and the Language and Literacy Education Commons

To learn more about our programs visit: http://www.brockport.edu/ehd/

Repository Citation
Thomas, Joy Morris, "A Comparison of the Philosophy and of Teaching of Third Grade Reading According to Houghton Mifflin Company (McKee) the John C. Winston Company (Stauffer) and Ginn & Company (Russell) Basal Readers" (1961). Education and Human Development Master's Theses. 927. https://digitalcommons.brockport.edu/ehd_theses/927

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Education and Human Development at Digital Commons @Brockport. It has been accepted for inclusion in Education and Human Development Master’s Theses by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @Brockport. For more information, please contact kmyers@brockport.edu.
A COMPARISON OF THE PHILOSOPHY AND METHODS OF TEACHING OF THIRD GRADE READING ACCORDING TO HOUGHTON MIFFLIN COMPANY (MCKEE) THE JOHN C. WINSTON COMPANY (STAUFFER) AND GINN & COMPANY (RUSSELL) BASAL READERS

JOY MORRIS THOMAS

STATE UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK
TEACHERS COLLEGE AT BROCKPORT
JULY 28, 1961

APPROVED:

[Signatures]

Faculty Advisor
Associate Dean
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply grateful to my faculty advisor, Miss Hazel Rench, for her kind and gracious help to a beginner in research. She has greatly increased my knowledge.

I appreciate the kindness of Dr. Grace Gates and others of the Clarence Central Schools in lending me several textbooks necessary to this study.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter I - Introduction ........................................... 1
Chapter II - A Comparison Aims of the Three Reading Series ........ 4
Chapter III - A Comparison of the Content ......................... 9
Chapter IV - A Comparison of Methods of Setting Goals for Silent Reading ...................................................... 17
Chapter V - A Comparison of Methods of Introducing New Words ................................................................. 21
Chapter VI - A Comparison of the Teaching of Word-Attack Skills ............................................................... 25
Chapter VII - A Comparison of the Teaching of Study Skills ................................................................. 29
Chapter VIII - A Comparison of Teacher's Editions .............. 33
Chapter IX - Results of This Study ................................... 40

Bibliography
A COMPARISON OF THE PHILOSOPHY AND METHODS
OF TEACHING OF THIRD GRADE READING
ACCORDING TO
HOUGHTON MIFFLIN COMPANY (MCKEE)
THE JOHN C. WINSTON COMPANY (STAUFFER)
AND GINN & COMPANY (RUSSELL) BASAL READERS

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Reasons for the Comparison

In the school system in which I teach, the individual
teacher has the opportunity of using the basal readers of various
publishers to parallel, supplement, or substitute for the gener-
ally-recommended series of readers, which is Scott Foresman.
I prefer to have each group in my class read from a different
series, in order to present a variety of material. It is neces-
sary to know the various reading systems in order to decide which
readers would best suit the needs of the different reading groups
in my class.

Limitations of Subject Matter

I have limited my study to three reading systems. These
systems are: The Reading for Meaning Series, published by
Houghton Mifflin, Dr. Paul McKee, authority; The Winston
Communication Program, published by The John C. Winston Company,
Dr. Russell G. Stauffer, authority; and The Ginn Basic Reading
Program, published by Ginn and Company, Dr. David H. Russell,
authority.
The basal readers from these series, used in connection with the Scott Foresman readers, should provide adequate basal reading material for my class, which will in all probability be divided into three groups.

The descriptions of aims, methods, and materials have been taken from the manuals, but I have summarized this information from many different places in these texts. No attempt has been made to tell the page source of each statement. However, it will be evident that the descriptions are not always unbiased, since they represent the opinions of the authors of the manuals.

Each of the basal systems I have chosen to study favors combining the use of a basal reading program (group reading and instruction) with an individualized reading program (each child reads individually-selected material under teacher supervision).

This paper will not discuss the undoubted merits or the methods of individualized teaching of reading. It is concerned only with a comparison of the philosophy, methods and materials of the basal readers of the third grade reading systems listed above.

Durrell summarized the value of the basal reader system as follows:

The well-planned basal-reading systems presented by experienced textbook publishers have many advantages. They provide the orderly practice required for the development of a sight vocabulary and the perceptual abilities to assure future growth. They save the teacher countless hours of preparation of materials, although she will still have plenty to do if slow learners are to be served well. The manuals accompanying such systems give advice for the motivation of instruction, for adapting to individual differences, and for observation of pupil needs. They are par-
ticularly helpful for the beginning teacher. A detailed study of the manuals of basal-reading systems is the first step to learning how to teach reading.

CHAPTER II

A COMPARISON OF AIMS OF THE THREE READING SERIES

Summary of the Aims of the Houghton Mifflin Series as Stated by the Authors

General Aims for the Entire Program

Reading for Meaning, the title given to this series of basal readers and accompanying materials, present a program of instruction with three major objectives:

1. to help the child build the power to read well independently, through a constantly maintained attitude of demanding meaning from his reading, and through the development of reading skills.
2. to help the child build an abiding interest in reading a wide variety of worth-while material.
3. to help the child build desirable personality and character traits.

Specific Aims for the Third Grade Program

The program of instruction for third grade has these specific aims:

1. to promote a continuing development of the reading abilities and interests.
2. to provide for individual differences.
3. to encourage children to read much more material than is available in any two third-grade readers.
4. to give ample practice at the third grade level in those reading skills which are essential to effective study of informative material.

5. to teach those understandings and skills which pupils must have to overcome special meaning difficulties.

Summary of the Aims of the Winston Communication Program as Stated by the Authors

General Aims for the Entire Program

The Winston Communication Program seeks:

1. to provide systematic guidance both in the acquisition of language skills, and in the use of those skills to think and to share ideas.

2. to enable children to understand, to discover, to create, to compare, to evaluate, to accept, to reject, and to organize and use thoughts and ideas effectively.

3. to help children find in reading a source of delight.

Specific Aims for the Third Grade Program

The only statement in the introduction to the Winston third grade manuals directed specifically to the teacher of third-graders is this:

The eight-year-old—interested in his world, eagerly searching every nook and cranny—is ready to be guided along the road to sound thinking. He is ready to be directed to be methodic about examining facts, questioning facts, making
evaluations, and reaching conclusions. This is the type of training that is being initiated in these activities on developing reading-thinking skills. ¹

However, in the manual's introductions to the various units, specific aims are stated, such as these for Unit III:

1. to help children prepare for later studies and critical evaluation of historical biography and geographical factors.
2. to provide plots giving experience with such character traits as courage, bravery, and unselfishness in order to give the child some basis for evaluating his own conduct.
3. to extend interpretive and word-recognition skills.
4. to enrich experiences for children who are becoming increasingly independent in the choice of reading material. ²

Summary of the Aims of the Ginn Basic Reading Program as Stated by the Authors

General Aims for the Entire Program

The Ginn Basic Reading Program attempts to provide the stimulation, support, and organized approach of a comprehensive and thorough reading program, so that children can enjoy and use reading both in childhood and in adult life.

These certain characteristics of a good basic reading pro-

1. Russell G. Stauffer et al., Teachers Edition for Into the Wind, p. 36
2. Ibid., p. 179
gram are listed in the manual. Every child:

1. learns to read to the best of his ability.
2. develops reading habits and skills at his own learning rate.
3. is taught by methods best suited to his particular needs and abilities.
4. becomes increasingly aware of the purposes for which he reads and of his own progress in reading.
5. becomes more independent in his use of reading materials.
6. participates in a balanced and varied program of reading activities.

Specific Aims for the Third Grade Program

The Ginn third grade program aims to:

1. help children make a successful transition from the closely supervised reading to which they are accustomed, into a diversified, independent reading program.
2. adapt the reading program not only to the grade level skills that they have so far learned, but also to the physical, emotional and social development of the children.
3. help the teacher diagnose and remedy individual difficulties.
Critical Summary of Aims

While the specific aims are stated in different ways and in different degrees of importance, basically they are the same for all three series: to help children acquire reading skills that will lead to independent, meaningful reading for information and for pleasure; and to help children grow in desirable social and character traits.

The chief apparent difference is in the Winston emphasis, repeated constantly in the manual, on critical thinking as a part of the reading process. While the other two systems recognize the importance of evaluative reading, the "reading-thinking process" becomes a doctrine of the Winston philosophy of teaching:

As we strive, then, to teach children to read, we are seeking for them fulfillment of that heritage which is the birthright of all free men--the four freedoms that accrue to the skilled reader and thinker: freedom from deceit, freedom from oppression, freedom from passion, freedom from ignorance.  

Ibid., p. 37
CHAPTER III

A COMPARISON OF THE CONTENT

A Summary of the Program of the Houghton Mifflin Series

These are the important features of the Houghton Mifflin program, as stated by the authors:

1. Controlled vocabulary presentation
2. The development of phonetic skill
3. The provision for individual difference
4. The suggestions for wider reading
5. The reading-skills program
6. The program of teaching pupils how to cope with special meaning difficulties

A Summary of the Content of the Houghton Mifflin Third Grade Readers

This program is carried out through the use of material that has been chosen to capture the child's imagination, and to contribute to character building.

The readers contain true stories, folk tales, popular juveniles. Each of the stories has been painstakingly adapted from a story of proven popularity with children of average third-grade age (eight-to-nine year-olds).

Each reader has plateau sections—reading for enjoyment with no new words. Each book is organized in three sections called "magazines". Each magazine has a 4-color cover and a table of
contents similar to that of a real magazine, with a line of comment following each story title. The format of the magazine can best be described by listing the material found in a typical unit--Unit 1, Climbing Higher, (3-2):

1. A long adventure story (4 reading lessons)
2. A reading skill lesson--Working with New Words
3. A humorous fairy tale (3 lessons)
4. Riddles About Words
5. Two jokes
6. A story about honesty, set in China (1 lesson)
7. An article about stockades (Preparation for the next story)
8. A true pioneer story (2 lessons)
9. A teaching unit--Finding root words; common endings; three poems
10. A funny story with a moral (1 lesson--no new words)

The following material is found in the Houghton Mifflin third grade readers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3-1</th>
<th>3-2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Looking Ahead</strong></td>
<td><strong>Climbing Higher</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 stories</td>
<td>13 stories</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 poems</td>
<td>6 poems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 articles</td>
<td>6 articles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 play</td>
<td>1 play</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 jokes</td>
<td>5 jokes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 page of riddles</td>
<td>1 fable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A Summary of the Program of the Winston Series

The authors of the Winston Communication Program advocate a "modified basic reader approach". Some of the salient points are summarized thus:

1. This approach uses both basic readers and the self-selection of other materials.
2. Self-selection is a supervised and organized activity.

3. Motivation of each individual, of groups formed by members with related interests, and of entire classes is accomplished through individual selection of materials.

4. Materials must be provided on a basis inordinate in comparison with a basic reader lock-step program. All kinds of materials at all levels of difficulty are needed.

5. Skills are taught.

6. Training is provided in recreational reading, in reading as a thinking process, and in reading-study.

A Summary of the Content of the Winston Third Grade Readers

The Winston basic readers carefully control the presentation of new words. Stories have plots with carefully planned details, constructed in such a way that the reader must read and will want to read to the very end to find out how the story ends.

The contents vary from fact to fantasy, with different time and space settings. Original and copyrighted material has been adapted and used. Each book has six units, each with a colored title page.

The Winston books are numbered in sequence, beginning with the first readiness book. The third grade readers are therefore numbered 3-10 and 3-11. The following titles of units give an indication of the subject matter of the various units:
A Summary of the Program of the Ginn Series

The Ginn Basic Reading Program emphasizes four distinct areas:

1. The Developmental Program
   Systemic group instruction using the basal text and related materials is given by the teacher.

2. The Recreational Program
   The children establish the habit of selecting and reading books for pleasure and information.

3. The Functional Program
   Reading of daily plans, directions, announcements, reports, and other materials in everyday classroom situations are carried on by the children.

4. The Enrichment Program
   Related skills are used and extended to offer the related, stimulating experiences that cause reading to become personally meaningful.

A Summary of the Content of the Ginn Third Grade Readers

Both Ginn third grade readers are composed of seven units,
each constructed around a major theme high in interest-value for third grade children. Each unit has a title page with a colored picture. The first unit in each book is based on the child's own environment and experiences; succeeding units reach out to new ideas and different people and times.

Each story is complete in itself, offering a well-defined plot, a climax, and interesting characterizations. At the end of each story are many suggestions for correlated reading and language activities and materials.

The unit titles clearly indicate the theme around which the stories center:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>3-1</th>
<th>3-2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Finding New Neighbors</strong></td>
<td><strong>Friends Far and Near</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pets and Playtime</td>
<td>All Through the Year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>At the Zoo</td>
<td>Work for Everyone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Just for Fun</td>
<td>Old Tales from Different Lands</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian Children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Americans All</td>
<td>Out of Doors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days Everyone Likes</td>
<td>Children Everywhere</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Old, Old Stories</td>
<td>Make-Believe Tales</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Critical Summary of the Content**

**Program:**

Although stated in different terms, all three basal reading systems use essentially the same program; the use of a carefully written basal reader, the teaching of reading skills, the teaching of study skills, and the encouragement to wider reading habits.
Organization:

The format of the Winston and Ginn readers is similar, each having stories grouped into units. In Ginn, the unit is based on the setting (At the Zoo), the topic (Work for Everyone), or types of stories (Make-Believe Tales). The Winston stories follow this pattern also, but are sometimes less clear-cut in their grouping. For example, Unit 1 in the Winston 3-10 reader is titled The Open Road and contains seven stories in a wide variety of settings, dealing with early European village life, pioneer adventure in Indian country, and present day family living. Their purpose is to expand the child's interests from the immediate environment to other periods and other cultures. Most of the stories in these two basic readers are a single unit, to be read in one lesson.

The Houghton Mifflin readers differ greatly in their organization, which has been previously described. The chief differences are these:

1. The material is not arranged in units, or centered on a theme.
2. Informative articles, skill lessons, jokes and riddles are included.
3. The majority of stories are divided into more than one lesson, because of their length.

Story Content:

The authors of the Houghton Mifflin and Ginn reading series
advocate the policy of presenting difficult and unfamiliar word concepts before the silent reading. This policy allows the use of a larger and richer vocabulary, resulting in greater freedom in sentence structure and choice of story content.

The policy of the authors of the Winston reading series is to introduce all new words in context during silent reading. This means that only words may be included for which natural and meaningful picture and language clues can be provided. This limits the vocabulary of new words to such an extent that, in my opinion, the stories in the Winston readers are rather stilted, and are less challenging in content than those of the other two readers.

This enrichment of vocabulary is evident in a comparison of the number of new words introduced in third grade: Houghton Mifflin, 804 new words; Winston, 485 new words; Ginn 682 new words.

The authors of all three reading systems recognize the importance of teaching character through stories which are not self-righteous or pompous, but I feel that the material in the Houghton Mifflin readers is especially well adapted to the teaching of moral and spiritual values. An example of this is the delightful story, "A Lion in the Kitchen", in which Agnes, who tells things which are not exactly true, learns that it is best to tell things just as they happened. Third graders are quite prone to exaggerate; this is an excellent opportunity to discuss this failing with the class impersonally.
Pictures:

The pictures in each of these series are most attractive. All are very colorful, ranging from simple line drawings to elaborately detailed paintings. Some are rich in humor and others extend the child's concepts and further his understanding.

The authors of the Winston series have been very careful in planning story illustrations, for they feel very strongly that at no time should the pictures reveal that which is intended to be told in the story. This sometimes occurs in the Houghton Mifflin readers, when pictures show details that should be learned by reading. There are some stories in the Ginn readers in which the pictures tell too much of the action of the story, thus giving away the plot.
CHAPTER IV

A COMPARISON OF METHODS OF SETTING GOALS FOR SILENT READING

The Houghton Mifflin Method of Setting Goals

The teaching units in the Reading for Meaning third grade manuals suggest ways to develop pupil readiness for reading the story. They recommend the following steps:

1. The teacher introduces a new story or section of story (since many stories in the Houghton Mifflin readers are read in several reading periods), or helps the children recall parts already read.
2. She makes sure pupils have the necessary informational background.
3. She introduces new words.
4. She sets a purpose for reading by asking a question or by telling the child what he is to find out in his silent reading. The manuals suggest one or more specific questions for the teacher's use.

The Winston Method of Setting Goals

The authors of the Winston manuals feel that the first step in group reading of a story is purpose-setting by the pupil. This is accomplished by the following steps:

1. During the purpose-setting discussion period, the teacher guides the children into the use of the new words that will be introduced in the story.
2. The children size up a story situation—by picture clues, title clues, story clues—and decide what they think is apt to happen in the story.

3. The teacher accepts for the pupils' purpose any possibility that is not a wild guess or foolish speculation.

4. The children are told to read to find out if what they have concluded is right or wrong.

The manual suggests several possible conjectures the children might make, but never limits others, and never suggests the part the teacher is to play in the discussion, since her participation depends on the ideas expressed by the children.

The Ginn Method of Setting Purposes

In the section of the Ginn 3-1 manual entitled Developing Readiness for Reading, this statement is made:

The amount of preparation for reading a specific story should depend on whether or not the children already have enough maturity and background information to grasp fully the meaning of the story theme. ¹

These general steps are then discussed:

1. The children's interest is aroused by a brief period of discussion, activities, and all kinds of visual aids used meaningfully to develop a rich conceptual background, often before the child opens his book. The teacher must be careful not to betray the plot.

¹ David H. Russell et al., Finding New Neighbors, p. 56
2. New words are presented.

3. The group, with the help of the teacher, defines a general purpose for reading the story.

The manual gives many suggestions for activities, reading goals, and visual aids for the teacher's use.

Critical Summary of Methods of Setting Purposes for Silent Reading

In this aspect of teaching of reading there are divergent opinions. The obvious differences lie in the timing of the presentation of new words (which will be discussed in the next topic), and in pupil versus teacher-setting of goals.

Both Dr. McKee and Dr. Russell advocate meaningful presentation of the new words which might present difficulties, preceding the silent reading. In the Winston readers, Dr. Stauffer eliminates the written introduction of new words, preferring to have them used incidentally to the oral discussion for reading-readiness.

The manuals for both Houghton Mifflin and Ginn contain specific ideas and verbatim questions for the teacher's use during the discussion period. The Winston manual leaves the teacher's participation in the preparatory discussion completely to her discretion, her purpose being to help the children clarify and state their own purposes for reading, and to encourage the use of the new words the story will present. She reminds them to read to check their own predictions. The Winston method re-
quires great skill on the part of the teacher, but, by this method, she can involve each child more directly in the light of his own past knowledge and experience, and make him personally interested in reading the story.

The beginning teacher would find the Houghton Mifflin and Ginn manuals extremely helpful, while the experienced, skillful teacher could use the Winston method with any suitable material which has a well-organized plot, pupil interest, and pictures which do not give away the story.
CHAPTER V

A COMPARISON OF METHODS OF INTRODUCING NEW WORDS

The Houghton Mifflin Method of Introducing New Words

The Reading for Meaning manuals have these suggestions for teachers concerning the pre-reading introduction of new words:

1. Introduce only words children are not likely to identify.

2. Print the word in a sentence on the board or on newsprint (not a sentence taken directly from the story). The teacher does NOT tell the word, but encourages the child to figure it out from context and sight clues, using his knowledge of phonetics. The sentence is left for reference during the silent reading.

3. Whenever the teacher feels the children are ready, the above step is eliminated and the children reminded to use what they know about letters and their sounds to think what word would make sense as they read silently.

4. If a pupil has difficulty with a word during silent reading, the teacher helps him to figure out the word by himself, by asking him to notice sound and context clues. If he does not then identify the troublesome word within a reasonable time, he is told what it is and the teacher makes a note that he needs further help with that word. Not too much time should be given to individual help during silent reading, however
The Winston Method of Introducing New Words

No written presentation of new words is made in the Winston reading-thinking program. The teacher is directed to take the following steps:

1. Before the silent reading of the story, she guides the children in an oral discussion period in which pupil reading purposes are set up. During this discussion, she leads them to the meaningful use of the new words that will be found in the story.

2. If the child asks for help during silent reading, she tells the child to read all the sentence or paragraph, to refer to a picture for clues, or to refer back to his reading purpose. If help is still needed, she gives help in phonetic attack, using a sheet of scrap paper.

3. If the child still does not recognize the word, she tells him the word and makes a note of his need, so that additional help can be given during the fundamental skill-training period.

The Ginn Method of Introducing New Words

The lesson plans in the Ginn manuals present these steps for the introduction of new words:

1. The teacher uses the words meaningfully in her oral introduction of the story.

2. Words which may present difficulties are written on
the board in meaningful sentences, or listed for phonetic comparison with known words.

3. New words which the teacher feels will not present a problem are left for the child to recognize in context.

Critical Summary of Methods of Introducing New Words

Here, the Winston method differs basically from the other two methods. The Winston manual gives this reason:

Carefully structured materials are prepared so that children learning to read may recognize new words on their own almost immediately in the context in which the words are presented. And if the efficacy of meaning is not enough, the pupils should have the opportunity of using, again on their own, the phonetic clues or structure clues they have learned.

In situations where the teacher writes all new words on the chalkboard and tells the children what the words are, or helps them analyze the words before they meet the words in context, the pupils do not have an opportunity to use the skills being taught. The teacher short-circuits their learning. ¹

The difference seems to be chiefly one of interpretation.

In speaking of "words the children are not likely to know", both Houghton Mifflin and Ginn seem to be referring to the concept behind the word, not to recognition of the printed form of the word only. Dr. McKee has this to say:

In general, most third grade readers, particularly those which include so-called social studies content, present concepts which are strange to many pupils for whom the books are intended. Obviously, therefore, the third grade teacher by her pre-reading of the selection to be taught, will have discovered the concepts or meanings which she thinks are strange to her pupils. Because she knows that the child must first construct those strange concepts in order to read the selection with adequate understanding, she then uses objects, pictures, simple explanations, and other means to

¹. Russell Stauffer, et al., Away We Go, p. 9
help the pupil do most of that constructing before he begins to read. The few strange concepts she ignores are those which are explained adequately by pictures and verbal context in the selection itself, and which she believes the child, if he has been taught to use pictures and context to build the meaning of a strange word or group of words, can construct as he reads. ¹

Russell expresses the same idea:

The teacher must be careful to build a background of concepts or ideas that are related to or occur in the reading materials. . . . If the child is reading his first story of early California, he may need help with such concepts as rancho, mission, and oxcart. Meaning of words, phrases, and sentences must be developed before a whole selection can be read with profit by many of the children. ²

It becomes apparent here that the material to be read in the Winston readers is a most necessary factor to the Winston method of word presentation. The stories do not present concepts that cannot be understood in context; the Houghton Mifflin and Ginn readers choose to include new concepts which are first presented to the children through vocabulary so they will later be understood in context.

¹. Paul McKee, Teaching of Reading in the Elementary School, p. 287
². David H. Russell, Children Learn to Read, p. 139
CHAPTER VI

A COMPARISON OF THE TEACHING OF WORD-ATTACK SKILLS

The Word-Attack Skills taught in the Houghton Mifflin Series

The Reading for Meaning third grade program continues instruction in figuring out strange words independently and practice in previously learned skills. The following new skills are taught in the third grade:

1. The teaching of certain phonetic elements:
   a. 3-consonant blends
   b. vowel combinations
   c. the vowel "y"
   d. common endings and prefixes
   e. certain common syllables
   f. contractions
   g. syllabication

2. Instruction and practice in finding syllables in words.
3. Much practice in using syllables and other phonetic elements, together with context, in attacking strange words.
4. The continuing development of a technique for attacking a strange word.

The Provisions for Teaching Word-Attack Skills in the Houghton Mifflin Series

The following provisions for teaching these work-study skills are made in the McKee manuals:

1. The skills are used in pre-reading word presentation.
2. Lessons on word-attack skills are incorporated in the basic readers--22 pages in each of the third grade
Section 3 of each lesson plan contains exercises on word analysis and reading skills.

4. The workbooks, *(Practice for Looking Ahead and Practice for Climbing Higher)*, help the teacher to provide the varied practice in specific matters which pupils need. The exercises can be worked independently by the pupils following teacher directions.

5. There is a section at the back of the manual containing model exercises, to be adapted to specific skill lessons.

6. Another section at the rear of the manual contains diagnostic phonetic skill tests to be duplicated for use with the pupils.

The *Winston* Series

The *Winston Studybooks* carry the work-load in developing phonetics in the *Winston Communication Program*. The *Studybooks* contain lessons on:

1. consonant blends and digraphs
2. factors influencing vowel sounds
3. inflectional and derivative changes
4. syllabication
5. contractions
6. root words
The Provisions for Teaching Word-Attack Skills in the Winston Series

In the section "Extending and Refining" in each lesson plan in the Winston manual, related activities for developing skills in the use of phonetic and structure clues appear consistently. This specific training is to be given after the story has been read, or in a special period of instruction.

At the end of the manual is listed an Analysis of Skills with reference to the pages in the manual on which the skills are treated.

The Word-Attack Skills Taught in the Ginn Series

All skills previously taught are reviewed and maintained in the Ginn third grade program. The following phonetic elements are also taught:

1. Extensive practice in the sounds of 3-letter blends and in the variant sounds of vowels.

2. New structural changes are taught; such as endings, and changes in root words before endings, prefixes and suffixes, compound and hyphenated words, and the apostrophe.

3. Syllabication--using the principle of syllabication in pronouncing new words, and developing the ability to divide words into syllables.

4. Readiness for dictionary usage--the teaching of syllabication, accentuation, and alphabetizing.
The Provisions for Teaching Word-Attack Skills in the Ginn Series

Each lesson plan in the Teacher's Edition consists of six steps. The third of these steps is *Building Essential Habits and Skills*. This includes many different exercises which may be duplicated and used for independent practice by the children.

The exercises in the workbook, *My Do and Learn Book*, accompany each lesson plan. They are planned so that the children may do them independently with a minimum of teacher guidance.

A very detailed *Index of Word-Study Skills* at the end of the manual tells the various skills taught, and the pages on which they can be found.

**Critical Summary of the Teaching of Word-Attack Skills**

The work-study skills taught in all three systems are essentially the same. All use workbooks for the study of these skills, and all include frequent and varied exercises in the manuals. Houghton Mifflin and Ginn offer much material for duplication to aid in meeting individual pupil-needs.
CHAPTER VII

A COMPARISON OF THE TEACHING OF STUDY SKILLS

The Study Skills Taught in the Houghton Mifflin Series

The Reading for Meaning Series at both primary and intermediate levels gives the child directed practice in reading for certain specific purposes. These purposes are:

1. Reading to get the main idea.
2. Reading to get details.
3. Reading to get the main points which a selection gives about its topic.
4. Reading to draw a conclusion.

Beginning in the third grade, the series teachers the pupil:

1. How to use the context to figure out the meaning of a strange word.
2. How to choose the meaning of a word that will make good sense in the context.
3. How to interpret figures of speech.
4. How to use punctuation marks as an aid to getting meaning.

Provisions for Teaching Study Skills in the Houghton Mifflin Series

The instruction in all these skills is provided through definite lessons in the readers themselves, through exercises in the workbooks, and through materials and directions for practice.
suggested in the manuals for the teacher's use.

The Study Skills Taught in the Winston Series

The basic premise of the Winston theory of teaching reading is that reading is a thinking process, and that the skills classified as "work-study" skills apply to all reading. These skills are not classified in the Winston teacher's manual. A list summarizing the skills is found in a brochure published by The John C. Winston Company. These study skills are:

1. Finding the central idea
2. Recalling sequence
3. Reading for details
4. Identification
5. Making judgments
6. Predicting events
7. Following oral directions
8. Differentiating meanings of single words
9. Classifying ideas

Provisions for Teaching Study Skills in the Winston Series

Many provisions for teaching these skills are made in the section of the teaching plan, Extending and Refining. The second halves of the Studybooks present 48 activities dealing with comprehension, practising the above listed skills.

1. Lyle Hance, Summary and Highlights of the Winston Communication Program, p. 11
Above all, the teacher insists on the child's continuous use of these skills, through the Winston method of setting and checking goals.

The Study Skills Taught in the Ginn Series

The list below includes major habits and skills emphasized by Ginn at the third-reader level for the development of comprehension:

1. The habit of using the table of contents.
2. The habit of selecting suitable reading materials for different purposes.
3. The habit of reading for information.
4. Systematic habits of attacking unfamiliar words in independent reading.
5. The skills needed to follow directions, detect details, and answer question.
6. The skills required to recognize and understand the main idea in a story and in other kinds of writing.
7. The skills needed to recognize and establish a correct sequence of events.
8. The skills needed to recognize relevance, to make judgments, to evaluate ideas, and to see relationships.
9. The skills required to draw conclusions, to generalize, and to make inferences.
10. The skills required to interpret material read in terms of personal and other reading experiences.

Provisions for Teaching Study Skills in the Ginn Series

Practice in these skills is provided through the use of charts, chalkboard exercises, worksheets, and the workbooks.

Critical Summary of the Teaching of Study Skills

A study of the lesson plans of all three reading systems will show that they all teach essentially the same study skills, though the Ginn manual has listed them more comprehensively than has the other two. Each system teaches critical thinking as part of the reading process—the difference lies in the emphasis placed on critical thinking by Winston, and in the Winston method of getting children to think in every phase of reading.
CHAPTER VIII

A COMPARISON OF TEACHER'S EDITIONS

The Organization of the Teaching Units in the Houghton Mifflin Series

Each teaching unit in Houghton Mifflin Books 31 and 32 is subdivided into four sections:

1. Preparation
   a. Setting the Scene
   b. Introducing New Words

2. Reading and Discussion
   a. Silent Reading
   b. Talking It Over
   c. Oral Reading

3. Word Analysis and Reading Skills

4. Provisions for Individual Differences
   a. Teacher-Participation Exercises
   b. Seatwork Exercises

The Organization of the Teaching Units in the Winston Series

There are two main divisions of each teaching unit in Winston Books 310 and 311:

1. Directing the Reading Activities
   a. Developing Pupil Purposes
   b. Observing Silent Reading
   c. Checking Pupil Purposes

2. Extending and Refining
   a. Basic Book Activities
   b. Studybook Activities
The Organization of the Teaching Units in the Ginn Series

Each lesson plan in the Ginn teacher's editions consists of six steps. The amount of time spent on each step should be based on the needs and abilities of the particular group being taught. These steps are:

1. Developing Readiness for Reading
2. Reading the Story
3. Building Essential Habits and Skills
4. Related Language Experiences
5. Enrichment Activities
6. All-Unit Activities
   a. Evaluating Activities
   b. Helping the Individual Child

Critical Summary of the Organization of the Teaching Units

All three systems follow the same pattern: motivation, silent reading, checking silent reading, teaching of skills, and enrichment activities.

A Summary of Features Shared by the Three Teacher's Editions

All three basal systems being reviewed here meet in a very thorough manner these principles listed by Russell as being the main requirements of a basal reading series:

1. It provides continuity of growth in reading skills, habits and attitudes by a carefully grades series of reading materials.
2. It provides for a wide variety of both work-type and recreational reading activities.
3. It provides a complete organization of reading experiences, avoiding gaps in learning experiences and providing in an organized way for the different reading abilities children acquire.

4. It provides for a worth-while content of ideas and types of conduct that are most important for junior citizens of a democracy.

Durrell has this to say about the contents of manuals:

Manuals of basal-reading systems are the best source for discovering the professional recommendations for the skills to be taught in each grade. Such manuals include a list of new words to be taught at each level of instruction in primary grades; the silent-and oral-reading abilities to be taught; the comprehension and recall levels to be expected.

Here again the manuals of the three systems contain this information. The Winston teacher's editions do not classify and list the various skills, and thus require a teacher to do much searching through the manual to find needed information.

Features of the Houghton Mifflin Teacher's Editions

1. The pages of the reader are reproduced in reduced size (in black and white) on corresponding pages of the teacher's manuals where instructions are printed. Therefore this book is small, light in weight, easily handled, and easy to refer to.

2. There is one table of contents giving both reader pages and manual pages where the story is found. However, there is no table of contents for the Teacher Introduction, and no index.
3. The philosophy, aims, and third grade program are well-defined in the Teacher Introduction, with a good description of content and teaching aids.

4. There are many provisions for meeting individual differences:
   a. Practice exercises in word analysis and reading skills, to be duplicated by the teacher or used orally with individuals or small groups.
   b. Word-Recognition Tests in the manuals at the end of each unit.
   c. A Reference Handbook at the end of the book containing model exercises to be adapted to individual cases, and a Phonetic Skill Test.

5. Bibliographies for children, for teachers' use with children, and for professional use are included.

6. Bibliographical sketches of the authors of the stories are found at the end of the reader.

7. Two tests are available: The Primary Reading Profile, Level 2, by Stroud, Hieronymus and McKee, (a standardized grade-placement test for beginning third graders), available for purchase from the publisher; The McKee Inventory of Phonetic Skills, Tests two and three, printed at the back of the manual for duplication, or available for purchase.

Features of the Winston Teacher's Editions

1. The child's reader is included at the back of the teacher's edition, necessitating turning back and forth in the book.
2. The table of contents at the beginning refers to both the pages in the manual and the pages in the reader where the story is found.

3. The introduction to the manual is devoted mainly to explanations of the Modified Bazic Reader Approach and the "Reading-Thinking" concept of the reading process advocated by the Winston Series.

4. The teacher's part in the manual does not have concrete suggestions for her participation in the pre-reading discussion, although the guidance of this vital period of the lesson requires great skill. There are suggestions for checking pupil purposes.

5. There are many oral and chalkboard activities, but none for duplication.

6. There are bibliographies of story books for children, fairy tales and folk tales, and professional books for teachers.

7. There is an analysis of skills and the pages on which they are taught in the basal book and in the Studybook.

8. There is a useful, well-detailed index.

Features of the Ginn Teacher's Editions

1. The child's reader is printed at the back of the Teacher's Edition, with separate tables of content for manual and reader.

2. The manual begins with instructions for its effective use.
3. The philosophy, aims, and methods are described in detail.

4. Analysis charts and check lists for individual diagnosis are described, and examples given.

5. Helpful charts summarize the activities of each unit.

6. There are very detailed suggestions for teachers' instructions to pupils.

7. A great many exercises for oral use, chalkboard presentation or duplication are given, in order to teach new skills or give individual help.

8. There is a detailed index of word-study skills at the end of the book, with page references.

9. A cumulative vocabulary for grades 1, 2, and 3 is marked with the grade-level of introduction of each word.

10. The bibliography is very extensive, with sections for: Professional Books; Teaching Children's Literature; Guiding Language Experiences; Art, Music, Rhythm and Games; Collections of Stories, Poems, and Songs; Stories for Children to Read; Other Readers and Textbooks; and Audio-Visual Materials (Listed by units). The stories for children's reading are marked for first, second, or third grade reading level.

11. There are directories of: Publishers; Distributors and Producers of Audio-Visual Aids; and Recording Companies.

12. The index is very detailed and helpful.
13. Three tests are available: The Third Grade Readiness Test, Revised Edition; Third-Reader-I Achievement Test, Revised Edition; Third-Reader-II Achievement Test, Revised Edition.

Critical Summary of Teacher's Editions

These manuals all offer much help to the reading teacher. The Houghton Mifflin and Ginn manuals would be especially helpful to the beginning teacher, since detailed instructions and much supplementary material are provided. The Winston manual is best used with the "reading-is-thinking" method Dr. Stauffer advocates, but the material in all three teacher's editions can be adapted to use with other reading systems.

The Ginn manual contains the most information and teaching material. The organization is such that the teacher can find information easily. This is not true of the Winston manual.

The Houghton-Mifflin teacher's edition is easiest to use in the daily reading lesson, because the reading page and the teacher's instructions are printed together. It is not necessary to use two books, or to turn from one part of the book to another.
CHAPTER IX

RESULTS OF THIS STUDY

When I began this study, I felt that the chief advantage of using several basal systems within one class was the variety of reading material such a plan offered. After studying the systems closely, I have discovered that each series has features which recommend it for a particular level or type of teaching.

Although there will be only 19 children in my room next year, it is very likely that they will be divided into three reading groups--those whose reading ability is above average, the average, and those whose ability--or achievement--is below average.

As a result of this study, I have made plans for the teaching of reading in these three groups for the coming year.

When teachers become sensitive to the complexity of the reading process and to the wide range of reading abilities within a class, they see the fallacies of using a single textbook for an entire class. 1

I plan to use the Houghton Mifflin Series with the group of above-average readers. The stories in this series of readers, I feel, are the most challenging in concept and in context. A survey of the Houghton Mifflin vocabulary lists shows the teaching of far more new words, many of them comparatively abstract. Because of the length of the stories, the lesson plans are flex-

1. Emmett Albert Betts, Foundations of Reading Instruction, p. 568
ible, so that the class can proceed at a faster rate of speed. The teacher can select from a large number of activities the ones needed by the group or individuals within the group, since the needs of this group will probably require less drill.

The middle or average group will use the standard text, Scott Foresman.

For the below-average group, I plan to use the Ginn Readers, beginning with the Ginn 2-2 book, Around the Corner, and advancing to the 3-1 reader, Finding New Neighbors.

I feel the Ginn readers are well-suited to the slower-learning group mainly because of the wealth of aids given the teacher, and the ease with which she can locate them. The instructions for administering the program are clear and concise. The manual abounds with practical exercises for oral presentation and for duplication, to use in building essential habits and skills. The bibliographies are very extensive and most useful because of the ways in which they are classified. I hope to be better able to meet the many individual differences likely to be found in a slow group.

I have not planned to use the Winston readers as a basal group text, but would like to have them available as a supplementary series to use with any of the three groups. The stories in the Winston readers, with their carefully structured vocabulary presentation, would be very suitable for a slow group, but the manual offers far less than that of Ginn in the extra exercises and drills so essential to this group.
I have never used the Winston readers. Perhaps I shall find them most effective. If this is the case, I shall certainly use this series as a group text.

No basal system of reading has been produced which makes automatic adjustments to the instructional needs of pupils. Even with the best of currently used materials, the effectiveness of learning depends far more upon the activities of the teacher than upon the basal-reading system being used. 1

Since the activity of the teacher is of prime importance, according to Dr. Durrell, and since I believe very firmly in Dr. Stauffer's stress on the importance of teaching critical thinking as part of the reading process, I plan to use his method of teaching to the best of my ability. I can feel justified in this use of method but not of manual, for Dr. Betts says:

Teachers' manuals written to accompany a basal series of readers should be used as a guide rather than as a prescription or a recipe. Most teachers' manuals, or guides, are well written and contain a wealth of suggestions for teachers using basal textbooks. In so far as she observes basic principles of learning, the teacher should feel free to modify the suggestions . . . . An interested teacher usually will want to read the teachers manuals to pick up new ideas and to familiarize herself with the general teaching plan and points of view of the authors. At no time, however, should the teacher become a slave to the manual. 2

This study has been very helpful to me. It will have been most worthwhile if the knowledge I have gained will make me a better teacher of reading.

Durrell, op. cit., p. 1
Betts, op. cit., p. 491
BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS


Durrell, D. D., Improving Reading Instruction, New York; World Book Company, 1956.


TEACHER'S MANUALS


PERIODICALS

Guilford, J. P., "Frontiers in Thinking That Teachers Should Know
Bibliography Continued


Staufer, Russell G., "A Directed Reading Activity--Group Type", Reading Teacher, April 1959, Vol. 12

Staufer, Russell G., Theme Introduction, Reading Teacher, February 1959, Vol. 12

MISCELLANEOUS

Hance, Lyle, Summary and Highlights of the Winston Communication Program, (brochure summarizing sales conference presenting the philosophy and features of the new Winston program)

Resource Kit, Ginn and Company

Student-Teacher Resource Kit for the Houghton Mifflin Reading Program